

Public association of social programs support “Adil-Demeu”

**Final evaluation
of the Central Asian Red Crescent Labour Migration Network
action**

Almaty, 2011

Introduction

The Central Asian Red Crescent Labour Migration Network is a project/action¹ supported by the European Commission initially over two years. This is the first project in the region funded by this donor and the first specific project for labour migrants implemented by the Central Asia National Societies. The project is part of the International Federation secretariat's plans for Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan in 2009-2011 and is implemented by respective National Societies.

Final beneficiaries of the action are labour migrants – prospective and actual – with regular and irregular status, and their family members. The target groups² include community-based organizations, educational organizations (schools, universities), indigenous people, local authorities, migrants, non-governmental organizations, young people, mass media, general public.

The budget of the action is 751,162 Euros, out of this amount 599,953 Euros have been pledged by the European Commission and the amount of 151,209 Euros is co-contributed by the International Federation secretariat.

Within the project framework the National Societies with support from the Federation secretariat have been providing services through established 10 Red Crescent information and education centres for migrants in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. The Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent has also been reaching beneficiaries through five mobile teams that are composed of the project staff and community members. The two centres in Uzbekistan started operating only in September 2010. Tolerance, respect for diversity and the need to oppose xenophobia, discrimination and social exclusion have been promoted at local and regional levels through public campaigns, information materials, publications in media sources, debates and round tables for partners and the general public.

In November 2010 a six-month non-cost extension of the project was agreed prolonging its duration up to 30 months, until June 2011.

Further in 2011 the migration services of the National Societies will be supported by the International Federation's secretariat with funds from other donors. For instance, in Kazakhstan the Red Crescent Society will increase the number of information and education centres for migrants and expand the range of provided services with support from the Japanese government.

3. Evaluation purpose and scope

3.1 Purpose:

The purpose of the evaluation is to uphold accountability and transparency, by demonstrating whether or not the work has been carried out as agreed, and to contribute to organizational learning allowing to better manage and deliver migration programmes and services.

The audience of the evaluation will be the EC project manager; project managers, relevant staff and leadership of the implementing National Societies; project coordinator and management in the IFRC regional representation, Europe zone and Geneva secretariat.

3.2 Scope:

¹ Project and action are used interchangeably through the text to refer to this specific project.

² "Target groups" are the groups/entities who will be directly positively affected by the project at the Project Purpose level, and "final beneficiaries" are those who will benefit from the project in the long term at the level of the society or sector at large.

The unit of analysis is the action funded by the European Commission under the Contract MIGR/2008/153-830. The time period of the project to be evaluated is December 2008-April 2011, the evaluated funds are funds actually expended at the time of the evaluation. The geographic coverage will include four countries involved in the project implementation, namely Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan and relevant regional/district/city units. The evaluation will cover final beneficiaries, local authorities and/or relevant government bodies, IOM, ILO, ACTED, local NGOs.

4. Evaluation objectives and criteria

4.1.1 Objectives:

- To assess whether the action expected results, specific and overall objectives have been achieved
- To provide recommendations for future migration programming of the National Societies in Central Asia

4.1.2 Criteria:

Relevance and appropriateness

- To what extent is the action suited to the priorities of the beneficiaries?
- To what extent is the action tailored to local needs and context, and compliments other interventions from other actors?

Efficiency

- How well inputs, (i.e. funds, people, material, and time), have been used to undertake activities and have been converted to results?

Effectiveness

- To what extent has the action achieved the intended immediate results?
- What are key lessons to inform further implementation and future interventions?
- To what extent were services and items delivered in a timely manner and to what degree service provision was adequately supported to achieve objectives on schedule?
- How well were various parts of the action managed in a cohesive and effective manner (coordination)?
- What is the stakeholder perspective of the action and services provided by the National Societies?

Impact

- What are the positive and negative changes from the action for the final beneficiaries and National Societies, direct or indirect, intended or unintended?

Sustainability

- Are the benefits of the action likely to continue once donor input has been withdrawn (institutional and financial sustainability)?

5. Evaluation methodology

The data will be collected through the review of secondary data sources and communication with key informants. Systems should be employed to verify data accuracy and completeness, such as cross-checking figures with other data sources etc.

Secondary data sources:

- Description of the action
- Logical framework matrices (original and revised)
- Action plans (original and revised)

- Budget for the action (original and revised)
- Progress reports on the action
- IFRC monitoring visits reports
- IFRC migration policy and working paper

Primary data sources:

- IFRC staff (focus on efficiency and effectiveness)

Proposed methodology: interviews with relevant staff in the regional representation for Kazakhstan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan (Almaty) and Tajikistan country representation (Dushanbe), with representative in Kyrgyzstan (Bishkek).

- National Societies staff and volunteers (focus on efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability)

Proposed methodology: interviews with staff of the National Societies at the headquarters and in branches; focus group discussions with National Societies volunteers at the project sites.

- Beneficiaries (focus on relevance and appropriateness, impact and sustainability)

Proposed methodology: focus group discussions at the project sites.

- Partner organizations (focus on relevance and appropriateness, effectiveness and impact)

Proposed methodology: interviews with representative(s).

Evaluation results

Information was collected in accordance with the Terms of Reference from 4 May 2011 to 31 May 2011. The researchers made site visits to collect data and analyse the situation and the project outcomes.

On 4 May 2011, the Chairman of the Association had a meeting with Ms Tastanova, Federation's Regional Coordinator, responsible for project performance at the regional level. Tasks and objectives of the Terms of Reference were discussed and additional information was provided. In addition, the participants approved the schedule of visits to information centres and communities in the above countries where Red Crescent's mobile groups work.

The project covers four countries: Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan. Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan are the countries of origin and Kazakhstan is the country of destination/transit.

Kazakhstan

Kazakhstan has three information and education centres for labour migrants. They were opened in 2009 at the Kazakhstan Red Crescent's branches in Astana, Almaty and Taldykorgan (Almaty Oblast).

The centres provide the following assistance:

- Legal assistance, legal and social information and consultations to migrants, including irregular migrants and *oralmans* (ethnic Kazakhs returning to Kazakhstan)
- Disease prevention (HIV, TB and other infectious diseases)
- Humanitarian initiatives for the most vulnerable irregular migrants and *oralmans*

- Assistance in tracing family relatives and sending messages to migrants' families

The personnel of the centres include coordinators, assistants, finance officers, lawyers, psychologists, and volunteers, including those from irregular migrants. Technical support is provided by system administrators in Astana, Almaty, and Taldykorgan. The programme also has a translator and a dentist. All centres are located in the premises of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent's branches and have the necessary furniture and office equipment.

To ensure the efficiency of the project, cooperation has been established with the following partner organisations:

- Government authorities: *akimats* (local executive bodies), departments for internal policy, health, education, internal affairs and migration police, employment and social protection;
- Government institutions: Centres for Social Adaptation and Rehabilitation for People without Permanent Residence; Psychiatry, Psychotherapy, and Narcology Centre;
- Commercial organisations: bus and rail stations, pharmacies, markets, construction companies, Developers Association of Kazakhstan;
- Public organisations: mosques, Centre for Support to Migrants from Uzbekistan, national cultural centres, condominiums.

Cooperation with these organisations include providing information to the general public and, primarily, labour migrants about the project and the activities of the centres, exchange of information, and joint initiatives. It also includes interviews and information campaigns with the local population to foster the protection of migrants' rights and prevent discrimination, xenophobia and social exclusion. A total of 300 people from communities were consulted.

In the beginning of the programme, all these partners showed misunderstanding, xenophobia and antipathy towards migrants. These were aggravated by depressive moods among the population caused by the crisis and the fear to lose work. For this reason, during the first six months of 2009, significant efforts were made to inform the general public about Red Crescent's activities on the whole and the programme in particular. Since partners' approach to migrants differs, it was very important to get their support for information campaigns and win their trust for an open dialogue about the problems of labour migrants.

Partners, except public associations, did not express significant interest. Government officials said they lacked a legal framework and private entrepreneurs were afraid their use of illegal migrants was to be revealed. However, by the end of the first year partners' attitudes towards both migrants and the programme have changed positively.

The economic crisis in the country caused job cuts and a reduction in peoples' purchasing power. In order to protect the population, the government has developed a Roadmap Programme, which provided for the creation of jobs at local levels such as the repair of roads, schools, and hospitals. It also provided for retraining of the unemployed people. However, the local population has preference with employers.

Before the crisis, the majority of labour migrants worked at large construction sites and in the trade and services sectors. During the first six months of 2009, the majority of construction sites in Kazakhstan remained "frozen." Because of a reduction in the purchasing power, the demand for goods and food also declined. This affected migrants working in the trade and services sectors.

Although the government policy aims to support and employ the country' own unemployed population, businesses continue to prefer labour migrants from Central Asian countries as

cheaper workforce. All these factors made illegal employment even more hidden. The majority of migrants working at construction sites became more reserved and closed. Very often they live at the sites they work at. Fewer quantities of migrants can be observed in areas visited by many people. Migrants avoid contacts and providing any information about themselves, because they are afraid of being caught and deported.

One of the main problems of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent during the first six months of 2009 was to find approaches to labour migrants. During the second six months of 2009, the situation in the construction market, which employs the majority of migrants, improved. Many “frozen” sites renewed work.

During the first six months of 2010, the project used its best endeavours to establish contacts and cooperation with local authorities and representatives of businesses and public associations. However, the Kazakhstan Red Crescent’s expectations have not been fulfilled.

The next step in finding approaches to migrants was to search for and recruit volunteers from migrants and to integrate the project with other Kazakhstan Red Crescent’s programmes.

An increase in migrants’ coverage in the second six months of 2010 became possible due to the work of Red Crescent’s staff and volunteers within the project and other programmes. The staff and volunteers have become more mobile and dynamic and integration with other programmes has been improved.

Almaty

The external assessment of the Project “Integration of the Central Asian Red Crescent Societies’ Work on Labour Migration” began with the Almaty Branch of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent on 5-6 May 2011. Kazakhstan is the country of destination in this project. So, the specifics and approaches differ from those used for the countries of departure. The work programme had two parts.

The first one included meetings with beneficiaries (labour migrants at the Almalyk Kala construction site, Navoi Ave) and the site foreman and project volunteer Ulugbek Kadyrov. There were twelve illegal migrants at the site, including ten from Uzbekistan and two from Kyrgyzstan. They said that many migrants came to Kazakhstan several times, most often illegally.

The second part included meetings with project staff, partners and volunteers. This was a roundtable with the participation of Ms Khasangaliyeva, Chair of the Almaty Branch of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent, Ms Kopbosynova, Project Administrator, Ms Shamshura, Coordinator for Tracing and Restoration of Family Links, and project staff and volunteers from the local community and labour migrants from Uzbekistan and Kyrgyzstan. An information desk for labour migrants was shown during the meeting, where migrants can receive information materials, brochures and booklets.

The project administrator made a presentation on the project activities in 2010, which was the most effective period.

During the period, 1,143 labour migrants from Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan received the following assistance:

No.	Assistance	Number of recipients
1	Food	550
2	Bedding	110
3	First aid kits	46
4	Psychological advice	100
5	Legal advice	86
6	First aid training	47

7	Healthy lifestyle training	88
8	On-site training	116
9	Information support	562
10	Volunteer preparation	110
	TOTAL	1,815

The centre also arranged large-scale information campaigns and roundtables on labour migration with partners. During the reporting period, the centre shot a video film about labour migrants, which became a finalist of the contest of social video films produced by Almaty NGOs.

Astana

During the reporting period, the centre did the following work:

1. Information campaign at the Central Market and in Asem shopping mall. Seventy migrants were covered from 9 to 12 February 2010. The purpose of this initiative was to find and inform migrants and the local population about the activities of the centre and to distribute booklets in the languages of Central Asian countries about the centre and its location and about its five areas of activities.
2. The roundtable “Work on Labour Migration by the Astana Branch of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent Society,” with the participation of local authorities, government officials, and NGOs. The participants included Mr Raushanov, Head of Migration Control at the Astana Department for Internal Affairs, Ms Beksultanova, dermatologist from the AIDS Centre, Ms Yerzhanova, Chair of the Astana Women’s League, programme staff and volunteers from labour migrants (a total of 15 people). The roundtable was held on 22 April 2010 at the Astana Branch of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent.
3. Information campaign on occasion of the celebration of the 8th of May, which covered about sixty migrants from 7 to 25 May 2010. Ten volunteers (in groups of two to three persons) visited places of possible concentration of migrants (markets, bus and rail stations, suburbs) every week. Their purpose was to find migrants and inform them about the activities of the centre. At the end of the initiative, on 25 May 2010, an information campaign was organised to distribute booklets about the activities of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent and about healthy lifestyle and to give away second-hand clothing, toys, and school stationery prepared by volunteers.
4. Information campaign at markets and in the suburbs (the main place where migrants live) about school education for migrants’ children. The campaign was arranged on 6 September 2010 and covered 55 migrants. In the first days of September, the centre received letters from migrants that their children had not been admitted to schools. These were migrants primarily from Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. The representatives of the centre and the International Organisation for Migration had meetings with the Department for Education and local authorities. This problem was raised in some other regions of Kazakhstan as well. After several requests have been placed, including an application from the Information and Education Centre for Migrants, and this problem was reported by the media, the General Prosecutor’s Office issued an internal order to the Ministry of Education and Science and the Ministry of Internal Affairs to admit children to schools and they were admitted. Fifty-five migrants were informed about this and were explained their rights. Meetings with school principals were arranged to discuss the provision of school education to migrants.
5. Information campaign at Artyom and Shapagat shopping malls, the Central Market, and construction sites. The campaign was held on 5 October 2010 and covered about 60 migrants. Twelve volunteers arranged meetings to establish contacts with migrants and distribute information booklets about the activities of the centre.

Taldykorgan

On 30 May 2011, a meeting was held with the project staff, volunteers and beneficiaries at the Information and Education Centre of the Almaty Oblast Branch of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent Society in Taldykorgan. The participants included Ms Korzhekenova, Coordinator of the Centre, Ms Omarova, Assistant Coordinator, a project psychologist, a dentist, a translator, a volunteer from Uzbekistan, and seven beneficiaries from Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan.

The following information was received during discussions and interviews:

1. From January 2009 to May 2011, the Taldykorgan Information and Education Centre provided assistance to 3,054 labour migrants (of which men accounted for 80% and women 20%). The centre provided 26 trainings in first aid and safe behaviour (324 persons), legal advice (633 persons), psychological support (511 persons), dentist services (117 persons), hot meals at the Kazakhstan Red Crescent's canteen (250 persons), limited humanitarian assistance (721 persons), first aid kits (181 persons), and bedding (230 persons).
2. Additional humanitarian assistance was provided to the most vulnerable migrants with the help of other Kazakhstan Red Crescent's programmes (disaster management and health). This included bedding (mattresses and covers) for 32 persons, second-hand clothing and shoes for 52 persons. Red Crescent's programme for tracing and restoration of family links helped establish connections with relatives of three migrants.
3. The centre arranged six information campaigns to distribute information about its activities, covering 2,507 people.
4. Twenty-six migrant volunteers were trained and involved to distribute information about the centre and the services of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent.

Assessment

- **Advocacy:** Staff and volunteers were trained and prepared to implement the programme. The information and education centres were equipped and opened. Information materials were published. These included five types of booklets in four Central Asian languages about the services provided by the centres, the tracing service, legal advice, and HIV and TB prevention, which were distributed by volunteers among labour migrants; posters for the local population and partners; and stickers with the programme's logo. Each centre provides professional legal advice and assistance in social adaptation and integration.
- **Integration and information campaigns:** Three Red Crescent branches (in Astana, Almaty and Taldykorgan) provided legal advice and psychological and social assistance to 6,800 irregular migrants (compared to the planned 4,000). Sixteen trainings in healthy lifestyle and first aid were organised, involving twenty volunteers, mostly from labour migrants. Twenty information campaigns were held (compared to the planned eight), with the participation of labour migrants, the local population, government stakeholders, NGOs, international organisations, the media, and state educational, health and culture institutions. They provided information about the programme, the activities of the centres, non-discrimination, and fight with xenophobia and social exclusion.
- **Promotion of humanitarian values:** Four roundtables were held. Outdoor advertisement was prepared and placed in Astana (two billboards). The media (TV and radio channels, newspapers) distributed 24 materials about the activities of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent, including the project.
- **Humanitarian assistance:** Limited humanitarian assistance was provided to 829 labour migrants, including those who arrived in the country very recently, poor migrants, large families, and those who have lost their documents and do not have work. Their key needs

are warm clothing, food, bedding, medicines, and hygienic kits. The Almaty centre provides food, bedding and first aid kits to 64 persons every month.

Achievements

The information centres and the project on the whole play a key role in providing assistance to labour migrants. In the reporting period the programme covered 6,800 migrants, compared to the planned 4,000. The percentage of men and women was 82% and 18%, respectively; the share of people aged over 63 was 9%. The Kazakhstan Red Crescent is the only non-government organisation in the country that provides comprehensive support to labour migrants as an image and capacity building initiative.

To ensure better management, research and improvements in the programme, the following approaches were used: compiling lists of beneficiaries, journals, letters of support and cooperation from partners, opinions and requests from migrants.

The work with labour migrants can become one of the Kazakhstan Red Crescent's priorities underpinned by deepening integration processes in Central Asia. The Kazakhstan Red Crescent incorporates labour migrants as a target group in its other programmes such as disaster prevention, health, and the tracing service. In 2010, the target group was expanded to include *oralmans* from Central Asian countries. This will also improve coverage of labour migrants. The centres arrange regular on-site trainings in the places of migrants' concentration (primarily construction sites and markets).

In addition to the project achievements and expected outcomes, we also need to analyse the barriers it faces.

The Kazakhstan Red Crescent faced the following challenges during the programme:

- Lack of interest and support from government authorities. Regular raids by the migration police complicate work with labour migrants as they are afraid of being caught and deported;
- Trainings: employers do not permit their workers to visit trainings during working hours and do not permit arranging trainings on site. This is because the majority of migrants work illegally and because of safety requirements existing in the construction sector which provides jobs to the most of them;
- Lack of training modules. In their work with labour migrants, the centres use modules that have been designed for schoolchildren and young people. The lack of migration guidelines and regulations also affects the efficiency of the Red Crescent's work on the protection of migrants' rights;
- Labour migrants avoid contacts because they do not have sufficient information, are afraid of fraud, or because of language barriers. They do not want to present their documents or to give them to other people even for copying because they fear that they would draw attention of the police;
- Employers are also reluctant to cooperate because they do not want the authorities to know that they employ illegal workforce.

Conclusions

The work of the centres deserves positive assessment; however it could have had a larger scale (the project covered Kazakhstan's largest cities of Almaty and Astana). The work with government authorities needs improvement. Planned meetings with partners were not arranged, so it is impossible to assess the level and quality of work with partners.

The meetings with beneficiaries showed that many labour migrants did not have sufficient information about the labour migration project and Red Crescent's activities. Only some of them received information in their countries of departure, primarily Uzbekistan and Kyrgyzstan. They knew about the project in the country of destination (Kazakhstan) from volunteers and project staff. However, they lacked information about possible assistance from the project, except humanitarian assistance such as bedding, food, and hygienic kits.

This leads to a conclusion that volunteers often cannot provide beneficiaries with full and reliable information about the project for various reasons (language barriers, migrants' fear to be cheated and deported). For this reason, we deem that information campaigns could have been more effective if they were arranged in the presence of a project employee. In addition, labour migrants often do not have sufficient information about their rights or about health institutions where they can receive free medical assistance such as HIV and TB testing.

Most often, migrants rely on help from their foremen who keep passports of almost all migrants and are actually intermediaries between them and the outer world. Foremen are not always Red Crescent's volunteers, so the problems of many migrants remain without attention. More attention should be paid and more efforts should be made to involve foremen as volunteers. Problems of labour migrants should not be tackled by a single project or organisation because this group is at HIV and TB risk, which poses threat to the society as a whole.

However, we should emphasise that each programme employee is willing to work and improve the project activities and that volunteers are very optimistic. All new ideas and plans for improvement come with time. This is true for any work. For this reason, we believe we should not criticise the project. The skills acquired by the project staff and volunteers and cooperation between beneficiaries and the Kazakhstan Red Crescent will definitely be of benefit to many migrants and will help implement many future projects.

Recommendations

In order to improve the project efficiency, close cooperation with government authorities is needed at both the local and national levels. Cooperation with partner organisations needs to be improved and common aspirations need to be determined. Interaction with countries of departure also needs to be improved as this will improve the quality of information and work. Joint initiatives should be arranged with government authorities such as the migration police and the Ministry of Social Protection, with the participation of migrants.

This integration will result in a situation where Red Crescent will not need to search for migrants in the country of destination, but migrants will come to the information and education centres on their own initiative.

Kyrgyzstan

The project assessment in Kyrgyzstan was conducted from 11 to 15 May 2011. On 11 May, we had a meeting with Yelena Pavlyuk, Migration Project Coordinator in Kyrgyzstan. She provided us with brief information about the project and the programme structure. The external assessment programme was also prepared at the meeting. It included meetings with government authorities, partners, volunteers, staff, and beneficiaries. In addition, a trip was planned to Alabuke District of Jalalabad Oblast, a region where increasing flows of labour migrants form.

The same day we had a meeting with Nurbek Omurov, IOM's Programme Coordinator, to discuss labour migration. Mr Omurov said that IOM has also been implementing a labour migration project through NGOs over the past four years. This project created hotlines for labour migrants in seven oblast centres. NGOs organised large-scale initiatives, produced video films, and made a billboard with the number of the hotline on it (189) in Osh.

However, there were no integration and joint work with Red Crescent, hence no joint initiatives, workshops, or roundtables.

On 12 May, we had on-site meetings in the southern region of the country with the representatives of Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's Migration Programme Anarkan Anabayeva (Programme Administrator for Osh) and Melis Chonoyev (Trainer and Advisor for the communities of Alabuke District of Jalalabad Oblast), and with community leaders, volunteers, and beneficiaries to discuss the project strengths and weaknesses. The meeting continued with a group (panel) game on the issues of labour migration between potential labour migrants. Four teams from Uzbek and Kyrgyz communities and about 600 spectators took part in the initiative. The jury included representatives from educational and health institutions and from the district department of the Ministry of Labour, Employment and Migration. This initiative helped provide the necessary information about labour migration to all spectators. Posters were put up and information materials were distributed during the event. All participants in the game received prizes.

On 14 May 2011, we had a meeting with the project and integrated programmes' staff: Yelena Pavlyuk, Gulmira Kabylbekova, Asel Kaldasheva, Saltanat Abdizhaparova, Rimma Sultanova, and others. We found out that all existing programmes and projects are closely integrated and arrange joint roundtables and workshops, and that many programmes have common target groups. Potential external labour migrants and internal migrants in Kyrgyzstan are among the Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's target groups. The National Society has been a member of the Red Crescent Societies Network since 2008.

The next meeting with Bolot Iskenov, Head of the district department of the Ministry of Labour, Employment and Migration, provided more detail about joint work. Close cooperation began in 2009 when the Lenin District Department of the Ministry took part in a roundtable organised by the National Society to discuss the problems of internal migrants and their access to social services. In 2010, 427 persons were consulted, including 223 women and 204 men. A joint workshop "Consolidation of All Social Sectors' Efforts to Promote Human Rights" was arranged with the involvement of trainers from the National Society. The workshop discussed human trafficking and demonstrated the film *The Long Way Home*. Twenty-four persons attended the workshop. In addition, the district department and the Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent arrange joint job fairs every year.

On 24 September 2010, the Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent and the Employment Centre of the Ministry of Labour, Employment and Migration organised a job fair in Archa-Beshik district. Two workshops were organised for school graduates to talk on AIDS, human trafficking, successful employment, professions, Russia's entry requirements, the film *Employment in South Korea*, and receipt of patents in Russia. Eighty-four participants attended the workshops.

The next joint job fair was organised on 23 December 2010 in Ak-Orgo district, with a workshop on labour migration, Russia and Kazakhstan's entry rules, human trafficking, and a film about migration maps. This workshop was attended by 24 people. During our visit, on 12 May 2011, another joint job fair was held, where Red Crescent also organised a workshop.

All these facts let us conclude that the Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent has established close cooperation with local authorities on labour migration.

The same day we had a meeting with Bolot Isakov, Migration Project Coordinator at ACTED. This organisation also works on labour migration and undertakes significant research. Mr Isakov said that although many organisations such as the Red Crescent, IOM, and ACTED that work on labour migration are considered partners, they have not had joint initiatives, workshops or roundtables within the framework of this project. They meet only at coordination meetings with the Ministry of Labour, Employment and Migration.

The next meeting was with Manas Turgungaliyev and Nuriya Temirova, programme volunteers in communities of internal migrants. They arranged a meeting with beneficiaries who provided positive feedback about the project and said they had received no assistance from government authorities. The National Society provided them with information, legal, psychological, humanitarian, and medical assistance and organised sewing and computer courses.

The Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's project opened two information centres with a hotline (197) in Bishkek and Osh and organised five mobile teams in the Bishkek centre (Oktyabr and Lenin districts) and at the Karasu, Batken and Alabuke district committees of the Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's South Regional Representative Office. The teams provide training and consulting on the issues of migration.

All the necessary conditions exist to ensure efficient work. The centres and mobile teams have the necessary equipment and communications facilities. Each team member (15 people) knows the project goals and objectives, his or her job instructions and the code of conduct, and has a plan of work. The project's technical personnel include a financial assistant, a logistics specialist, and two drivers in the Osh and Bishkek centres. The staff (an assistant coordinator, two administrators of the information centres, two trainers in the centres, and five trainers for communities) was trained in providing consultations and trainings and information distribution.

Trainers received all the necessary information, handouts and other materials in hard copies and in an electronic form on flash drives (the so-called "electronic bags"), as well as video films about the prevention of illegal migration risks and the Principles of the Movement. Field assessments of information needs of migrants and their families were made and pre-test trainings were organised in migrants' communities. The consultancy and training guidelines in Kyrgyz were prepared according to migrants' requests. Information desks for target groups were opened in all the supervised villages. The "cascade" method is used to train target groups in migration issues.

The project is being popularised among migrants, the general public, and partners with the help of the media, public campaigns, visibility products (folders, pens, T-shirts, bags, vests), signs, posters, booklets, calendars, information desks, and video films broadcasted by TV channels. The visibility products have the network's logo on them. Migrants appreciate the Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's assistance.

Cooperation with the following partner organisations was established to ensure the project efficiency:

- State Migration and Employment Committee/mobile employment services;
- IOM and its divisions;
- Ombudsmen;
- Ministry of Health and its regional departments and bodies;
- Local authorities;
- Research institutions (Social Research Centre at American University of Central Asia, Social Technologies Association);
- Communities;
- Young people;
- Migrants;
- Local NGOs and NGOs in countries of destination;
- Media;
- General public.

Twenty leaders and 40 active volunteers help promote the project in communities. The migration project is integrated with the Red Crescent's health programmes: Training in First AID,

HIV/AIDS Prevention, TB Prevention, Polio Vaccination, Strengthening the Role, Socioeconomic Conditions and Reproductive Health of Vulnerable Women in the Kyrgyz Society, and some others.

The Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent has been proactive in recruiting migrants and their families as trainers and volunteers for the peer-to-peer distribution of information and the development of a new proposal for 2011-2012. Public campaigns were organised to distribute information about the project and advocate for the rights of vulnerable internal migrants. A mobile cinema organised and attracted more people than it had been planned.

Drawing the general public's attention to internal migration with the help of social art helped not only understand problems of migrants and their families, but also evaluate the human and creative potential that can be used for the benefit of the country.

The project also provided assistance to migrants' families. This included finding a private sponsor for a humanitarian action in Alabuke and providing about 350 New Year presents to children from poor migrants' families in Bishkek (Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's decade "Give Joy to Children"). On occasion of the 8th of May and 1st of June, about 200 children from isolated communities were invited to cinemas to watch animations free of charge.

An advocacy campaign is being held together with the project "Strengthening the Role, Socioeconomic Conditions and Reproductive Health of Vulnerable Women in the Kyrgyz Society" to reduce the vulnerability of internal migrants who do not have permitted residence in Bishkek by providing them with access to basic social services.

This work resulted in that parliamentarians who are involved in the Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's campaign have begun discussing these issues at the legislative level. Amendments were made to the Law *On the Employment of Citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic* providing an opportunity for the unemployed to register at places of their residence with municipal and district employment services. Before these amendments, people who arrived in another area could not register as the unemployed without registration of permitted residence. However, this is only a small result of the huge work to do in the future.

Assessment

- **Advocacy:** Staff and volunteers were trained and prepared to implement the programme. Two information centres with a hotline (197) were opened in Bishkek and Osh and five mobile teams were created in the Bishkek centre. The consultancy and training guidelines were developed and electronic bags were prepared for trainers.
- **Integration and information campaigns:** The two centres provided legal, psychological and social assistance to 8,000 people, compared to the planned 6,000. Two TOTs were organised for the project staff and 20 TOTs for community leaders and volunteers. More than 1,300 sessions and trainings and 3,000 personal consultations and consultations in writing were provided to beneficiaries. These covered the issues of labour migration and associated rights and responsibilities, including the issues of exploitation and fraud, tracing and restoration of family links, access to the labour market and labour opportunities and resources, prevention of HIV, TB and other infectious diseases, psychological and social support, and consultations about safe behaviour and general living skills.
- **Promotion of humanitarian values:** Mobile cinemas made over 40 visits to target communities to show and discuss video films about the risks of illegal migration. Two press conferences, 15 roundtables and 30 bilateral meetings with partners were arranged. Four contests were organised in the target communities for the best script about the

prevention of labour migration risks (the communities preferred the format of the KVN game). The following public campaigns were arranged: *All Are Different and All Are Equal: Everyone Deserves Attention* (social reports, debates and discussions, work with the media); *One Day of a Migrant's Life* (a photo project), and *Give Joy to Children* (fundraising to buy 370 presents for children from vulnerable migrant families). The project was integrated with the advocacy campaign to reduce the vulnerability of internal migrants by providing them with access to basic social services. This campaign is within the framework of the project "Strengthening the Role, Socioeconomic Conditions and Reproductive Health of Vulnerable Women in the Kyrgyz Society." The project staff, volunteers and leaders exchanged experienced and best practices during visits.

- **Humanitarian assistance:** A humanitarian action was organised for persons displaced after the June events.

Achievements

More than 8,000 people (compared to the planned 6,000) were covered over 2.5 years (March 2009-May 2011) in twenty migrant communities, of which men accounted for 45% and women 55%. The share of school and college graduates was 60%, and people aged over 63 – 10%. An efficient network has been set up (centres/mobile teams). A significant number of community leaders and volunteers are involved.

Challenges

1. Growing migration processes
2. Integration/reintegration challenges because of discrimination, social exclusion, and negative attitude on the part of the media, local communities, and government authorities
3. Volunteer motivation
4. Lack of feedback from migrant communities in Russia
5. Cooperation with partners (external and internal, lack of coordination in the sphere of migration)
6. Lack of programme funds to provide assistance to the most vulnerable migrants

Conclusions

The Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's labour migration project deserves positive assessment. It has a clear structure and the work on it is dynamic and well coordinated. The project provides necessary assistance to beneficiaries and is integrated with other programmes.

The project staff and volunteers have a serious and good faith approach to their work.

All the necessary conditions exist to ensure efficient work. The centres and mobile teams have the necessary equipment and communications facilities. Each team member (15 people) knows the project goals and objectives, his or her job instructions and the code of conduct, and has a plan of work.

The project's technical personnel include a financial assistant, a logistics specialist, and two drivers in the Osh and Bishkek centres. The staff (an assistant coordinator, two administrators of the information centres in Osh and Bishkek, two trainers in the centres, and five trainers for communities) was trained in providing consultations and trainings and distribution of information.

The project is being popularised among migrants, the general public, and partners with the help of the media, public campaigns, visibility products (folders, pens, T-shirts, bags, vests), signs, posters, booklets, calendars, information desks, and video films broadcasted by TV channels. The visibility products have the network's logo on them. Migrants appreciate the Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's assistance.

All these facts let us conclude that the work in the region is very proactive. The project covers many groups of the population and different ages. It works with both external and internal migrants and their families.

However, we should note that the project lacks integration with partners such as IOM and ACTED which have a significant experience in labour migration initiatives.

Recommendations

Closer cooperation should be developed with the Central Asian Red Crescents. Since many labour migrants go to Kazakhstan and Russia, cooperation needs to be improved with the Red Crescent and the Red Cross in these countries. This integration will result in better feedback from migrant communities in Russia. To this end, we can create a platform to regularly discuss the issues of labour migration (including reintegration of those who return home) with all stakeholders and the National Societies' network, which will provide an opportunity for the Russian Red Cross, IOM and state authorities to participate.

We also propose that applications to donors should focus on volunteer motivation. The work with government authorities needs to be improved and extended beyond the Ministry of Labour, Employment and Migration. Roundtables and workshops should be organised with partner organisations such as IOM and ACTED. This integration with partners will improve the Kyrgyzstan Red Crescent's recognisability in the country and abroad.

Tajikistan

The external project assessment in Tajikistan was conducted from 16 to 23 May 2011.

On 17 May 2011, we had a meeting in the Tajikistan Red Crescent's Shahrison District information and education centre with Zulfiya Azimova, acting Migration Project Coordinator, and Farrukh Kasymov, Migration Project Coordinator at the Country Office of the International Federation. The following information was provided at the meeting.

During the reporting period (2009-2011), the Tajikistan Red Crescent, in close cooperation with local authorities, selected five priority regions (Roshtkala, Panj, Vose', Asht, and Shahrison), which have the greatest numbers of labour migrants going abroad. The selection criteria included the extent of migrant flows, the regions' distance to large cities and administrative centres, and stakeholders' access to the information and education centres.

The information and education centres for labour migrants were set up in all the five districts. Their purpose is to provide services and assistance tailored to the needs of labour migrants (both regular and irregular) and their families. The centres work five days a week (Mo-Fr) from 8:00 am to 5:00 pm.

Qualified personnel were recruited for the centres in accordance with the rules of the International Federation and the Tajikistan Red Crescent and Tajik employment legislation. Each centre has three qualified employees: a lawyer, an IT specialist, and a Russian teacher.

In December 2010, qualified psychologists were selected to work with migrants and their families. The psychologists work in two information and education centres in Sughd Province (Shahrison and Asht). The reason for enhancing the project with this additional activity was the

fact that, according to official statistics, Sughd has the largest number of divorce and suicide cases in the country.

“According to the authorities, during the first nine months of 2009, about 4,500 divorces (up 232 cases compared to 2008) and 435 suicides were registered. During the first eight months of 2010, the number of suicide cases increased to 450, of which 320 were committed by the unemployed, primarily women.”

Over the project period, the five Tajikistan Red Crescent’s centres in Asht, Shahrison, Panj, Vose’ and Roshtkala consulted and trained 15,237 labour migrants (including potential and actual migrants) and their families.

Services provided to labour migrants in 2009-2011

Services	Age and gender							
	16 to 20		21 to 35		36 to 50		Total	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
Legal consultations	1,313	754	1,524	844	884	451	3,721	2,049
Language courses	1,354	811	1,445	773	624	309	3,423	1,893
Computer courses	1,082	681	913	713	465	297	2,460	1,691
Total	3,749	2,246	3,882	2,330	1,963	1,057	9,604	5,633

The project and the health programme of the National Society conducted seven trainings on the prevention of HIV/AIDS, TB and other infectious diseases and on first aid. These trainings covered about 70 volunteers from labour migrants.

A meeting with the project staff, volunteers, partners, local authorities and beneficiaries was held in the Shahrison centre. The centre has all the necessary materials, including regulations on labour migration, an information desk with donors’ logos, and a computer room.

We had a meeting with the lawyer, the psychologist, and the Russian teacher. In addition, we had an opportunity to visit a workshop organised jointly with the centre’s partners. The workshop provided information and consultations to 18 potential labour migrants. It was organised by IOM, the Tajikistan Red Crescent’s Shahrison branch and the Shahrison District State Agency for Social Protection, Employment and Migration.

An open Russian class and a psychologist’s consultation for potential migrants were organised for thirty 10 and 11-grade schoolchildren. After these meetings, the participants prepared a play about HIV/AIDS and labour migration.

On 18 May 2011, we had a visit to the Asht District information and education centre in the village of Shaidan, Sughd Province. This district has a population of 133,000 and has the largest outflow of labour migrants, which increases every year. For this reason, this information and education centre works very intensely.

In this centre, we had a meeting with the project staff, volunteers and beneficiaries. The project here was launched on 20 May 2009. The centre has all the necessary equipment, training schedules, and teaching modules for Russian and computer classes. It also has all the legal materials and documents on labour migration, an information desk for labour migrants, and a small library with legal materials for labour migrants. The centre has provided Russian courses and legal consultations to more than 1,600 migrants and their families.

The next meeting was with Rano Kamolova, Coordinator for the Restoration of Family Links Programme. Ms Kamolova said that the labour migration project is integrated with the

programme since this district is one of the largest suppliers of labour migrants. For this reason, migrants' families often face hard challenges such as divorces, suicides, and loss of relatives.

According to Rauf Yussupov, Head of the Sughd Department for Internal Affairs, in the first six months of 2009 144 suicides and 52 attempted suicides were registered in Sughd, including 68 men, 70 women, and 16 minors. In the first six months of 2008, 119 cases were registered. These facts suggest that the programmes should be integrated and that the need for a psychologist is very high.

In the centre, we met with labour migrants and returnees, who have for many years worked in Russia and Kazakhstan. Ten years after they had for the first time travelled to these countries of destination, they received useful information about their migration policies and laws and about HIV, TB, and first aid. They also were provided with psychological assistance.

The same day we met with Zarif Mirdadoyev, Head of the Asht Youth and Tourism Department, with whom the Tajikistan Red Crescent's Asht branch and volunteers organise joint initiatives. Information and consultations are provided to labour migrants on bus stations and booklets and other information materials are distributed weekly. Joint initiatives also include first aid actions and workshops.

On 20 May 2011, we met with IOM in Dushanbe to discuss labour migration. IOM has established close cooperation with the Tajikistan Red Crescent, conducts consulting workshops, and provides information materials for the project. It also has a hotline to provide labour migrants with necessary information.

The Tajikistan Red Crescent opened five information and education centres for the project. Their location was selected in close cooperation with local authorities. Five priority districts (Roshtkala, Panj, Vose', Asht and Shahrison) were chosen which have the highest outflows of labour migrants going abroad. The selection criteria included the extent of migrant flows, the regions' distance to large cities and administrative centres, and stakeholders' access to the information and education centres.

The information and education centres for labour migrants were set up in all the five districts. Their purpose is to provide services and assistance tailored to the needs of labour migrants (both regular and irregular) and their families. The centres work five days a week (Mo-Fr) from 8:00 am to 5:00 pm and have the necessary furniture and office equipment.

Qualified personnel were recruited for the centres in accordance with the rules of the International Federation and the Tajikistan Red Crescent and Tajik employment legislation. Each centre has three qualified employees: a lawyer, an IT specialist, and a Russian teacher.

In December 2010, qualified psychologists were selected to work with migrants and their families. The psychologists work in two information and education centres in Sughd Province (Shahrison and Asht). The reason for enhancing the project with this additional activity was the fact that, according to official statistics, Sughd has the largest number of divorce and suicide cases in the country.

According to the authorities, during the first nine months of 2009, about 4,500 divorces (up 232 cases compared to 2008) and 435 suicides were registered. During the first eight months of 2010, the number of suicide cases increased to 450, of which 320 were committed by the unemployed, primarily women. (Source: www.asiaplus.tj).

The Tajikistan Red Crescent cooperates with government authorities. The relationships between the National Society and government bodies (local authorities) are good. Close cooperation has been established with local authorities and the Department for Social Protection of the Population in Asht, Shahrison, Vose', Panj and Roshtkala districts. Local authorities know

about the National Society's role and activities with regard to labour migration and this strengthens the National Society's position.

Assessment

- **Advocacy:** Five information and education centres have been opened and equipped and personnel were trained and prepared. Over the project period, the Tajikistan Red Crescent arranged eleven information campaigns about the activities of the centres, including five campaigns to present the five centres and six TV broadcasts of a short film about the activities and location of the centres (five in Sughd Province and one in Panj District). In addition, eight district and national newspapers published articles about the centres.

From 1 to 15 December 2010, the centres' staff and volunteers from labour migrants undertook a survey among regular and irregular migrants to identify their educational needs and the main gaps in the centres' activities. A total of 50 migrants were surveyed, including 30 men and 20 women. The survey showed that the main weakness of the centres, in the opinion of beneficiaries, is the lack of professional education for labour migrants, in particular in the area of construction, because the lack of professional skills is the main obstacle to the employment of migrants and the improvement of the quality of their life.

Training modules on legal, social and health issues were prepared for the centres with the Federation's support and in cooperation with IOM. They were printed and sent to the centres in Asht, Shahrison, Vose' and Panj districts and to Gorno-Badakhshan Autonomous Province. In addition, Russian and psychological support modules were prepared for the project.

Over the project period, about 270 volunteers from labour migrants and 15 employees of the information and education centres received training to improve their skills in the area of labour migration and to distribute information among target groups in their respective districts.

From the project beginning, the five centres provided training and consultations to 15,237 labour migrants, of which women and girls account for 37%. Russian and computer courses as well as legal training were provided.

A total of 37 trainers were trained from volunteers and community leaders. All of them distribute the skills and information they had received among their communities with the help of leaflets for labour migrants and brochures on the prevention of HIV, TB and other infectious diseases.

The National Society printed and distributed 3,950 booklets for labour migrants, 1,800 of which were bought by the Norwegian Red Cross. These materials include the main information about labour migration, the prevention of HIV/AIDS, TB and other infectious diseases, and first aid. In addition, 16 caps and vests with the National Society's logo were bought for fifteen employees of the information and education centres and one psychologist.

Psychological assistance was provided when necessary by the centre staff and medical personnel of the branches. Labour migrants and their families also received legal consultations in the centres. The centres received 36 letters from migrant families, on which they worked in close cooperation with the programme for tracing and restoration

of family links. The project and the programme helped three families to restore family links by finding their relatives abroad.

- **Integration and information campaigns:** The project activities were covered by the media two times, within the framework of public campaigns. On 7 May 2011, the day before the World Red Cross Red Crescent Day, a public campaign was organised with the National Society's youth programme. Fifteen volunteers and three project employees, 127 schoolchildren, six teachers, and representatives of government authorities took part in the event. This campaign was organised at the Roshtkala information and education centre for labour migrants. It included ping-pong, checks and chess competitions among schoolchildren and a quiz about the International Red Cross and Red Crescent Movement and labour migration. About 260 brochures for labour migrants were distributed. The event was broadcasted by the Gorno-Badakhshan TV channel.

Over the project period, the centres' staff arranged twenty on-site information campaigns in Asht, Shahrison, Vose', Panj and Roshtkala districts. The themes covered included the problems of labour migrants, non-discrimination, and diversity. The National Society's coordinator took part in seven events relating to the migration programme, which were organised by the state migration service and IOM.

- **Promotion of humanitarian values:** From the beginning of the project, the centres' employees, including the project coordinator and two executive secretaries, took part in five regional meetings on migration in Almaty and Astana, Kazakhstan. Four visits were organised between four information centres in Asht, Shahrison, Panj and Vose' districts to share experience.

Conclusions

The project is, on the whole, fruitful and deserves positive assessment. The existing information centres for migrants provide them and their families with necessary services which are tailored to their needs. Many communities have known about the programme through meetings, distribution of information, the media, and distribution of knowledge by volunteers.

There is good cooperation between government authorities, NGOs, local authorities and community leaders. They have official and non-official meetings and information is distributed in the form of booklets, leaflets, and short TV films.

As other countries, Tajikistan faced the global crisis which caused an increase in unemployment and return of labour migrants. Observations by the information centres showed that this problem had worsened the socioeconomic situation in families (particularly vulnerable large families in rural areas) as they had very small money. This caused an increase in divorce and suicide cases in rural areas. According to the authorities, during the first nine months of 2009, about 4,500 divorces (up 232 cases compared to 2008) and 435 suicides were registered. During the first eight months of 2010, the number of suicide cases increased to 450, of which 320 were committed by the unemployed, primarily women. Sughd Province accounts for more than 50% of all divorce and suicide cases.

Partnership

The Tajikistan Red Crescent coordinates its work, exchanges information and brochures and arranges meetings with its official partners, the Central Asian National Societies (Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan, and Kyrgyzstan).

The Tajikistan Red Crescent and the Kazakhstan Red Crescent share experience, information materials, and coordinate the provision of services to labour migrants. In March 2010, the Kazakhstan Red Crescent (Astana branch) requested the Tajikistan Red Crescent to provide assistance to a labour migrant from Tajikistan and recruit him as a National Society's volunteer

to take part in disaster preparedness activities, other initiatives or distribution of information in communities. The National Society requested Qurghonteppa Regional Branch to help the labour migrant. It also has provided assistance to the Kazakhstan Red Crescent in translating information materials for labour migrants from Tajikistan.

The Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan Red Crescents cooperate on the project by sharing information through official correspondence.

Partnership with Government Authorities

The Tajikistan Red Crescent has established close relationships with government authorities (local government bodies). It coordinates its work with local authorities and cooperates with the Departments for Social Protection of the Population in Asht, Shahrison, Vose', Panj, and Roshtkala districts. Local authorities know about the National Society's role and labour migration activities. This strengthens the position of the National Society.

Recommendations

Cooperation with the Central Asian Red Crescents should be strengthened. Proposals on cooperation should be made to the Russian Red Cross, because Russia is the main country of destination for Tajik labour migrants. Sharing of information with the countries of destination and transit should be improved. Labour migrants should be informed about the activities of the Red Crescent not only in their country of origin, but in the country of destination as well. Labour migrants should be provided with information about the Red Crescent's programmes in countries of destination so that they knew where they can go when they arrive in these countries and what assistance they can receive.

Uzbekistan

The project assessment in Uzbekistan was conducted from 24 to 29 May 2011. On 24 May 2011, we had a meeting with Svetlana Jalilova, Project Coordinator, and Elvira Amiraliyeva, Uzbekistan Red Crescent's Executive Director. We found out that the project in Uzbekistan started on 1 September 2010 only. The project locations were the town of Qarshi in Qashqadaryo Province and the town of Termez in Surxondaryo Province. A delay in launching the project was caused by the fact that money transfers for such programmes need to be approved by all ministries. This is a significant government barrier which delays the project implementation.

Despite these difficulties, the project was launched in September 2010. Its objectives were to improve the situation of labour migrants irrespective of their legal status by providing them with information about their rights and responsibilities in the form of regular trainings for migrants, workshops with partner organisations, and other initiatives.

In 2010, information, legal and psychological consultations were provided to 420 people.

Reporting period	Project	Target group	Total number of people who received assistance	Percentage of women	Percentage of men	Percentage of children aged under 18	Percentage of people aged over 63
2010	Central Asian Red Crescent Labour Migration Network	Labour migrants (potential and actual, regular or irregular) and their families	420	33% (139 women)	66% (281 men)	No	No

Psychological assistance (a psychologist was recruited as a volunteer) was provided to 198 people. Legal assistance (a volunteer lawyer was involved) was provided to 198 people. Health consultations (by an epidemiologist, a phthisiologist, and other specialists) were arranged for 93 people.

In addition, consultations are provided on a hotline, two times a week, in cooperation with the provincial divisions of the Labour Migration Agency. Illegal labour migration and forced labour are paid significant attention. The information and consultation rooms in the pilot regions arranged telephone calls for eight women to their husbands who had gone for work to Russia. Consultations on filling in declarations in Russian were provided to 384 people, with the help of the representatives of *mahallyas* (foundations; please see a description below).

On 28-28 May, we visited the town of Qarshi where the project was being implemented. We had a meeting with Askar Sattorov, Project Coordinator, at the information and education centre. Although the funding was delayed, the centre has the necessary materials, an information desk for labour migrants, and information posters with the EU, IFRC and Red Crescent logos. Workshops on labour migration are organised in cooperation with partners such as the *mahallya* and the Provincial Board for Labour and Social Protection of the Population.

On 27 May, we had a meeting with Shukhrat Kuchkarov, Head of the Provincial Justice Department, and Abdumutallib Dadajanov, his deputy, to discuss labour migration in the region. The Qashqadaryo Province Justice Department provides regular legal consultations for the general public in the province, on labour migration in particular.

Legal consultations are also provided by the Uzbekistan Red Crescent in Qarshi, where the project is being implemented.

The same day we had a meeting with the chair and employees of *Pahtador Mahallya*, a foundation which links the government and the general public and plays a significant part in the development of the society. Such foundations exist in every district and provide the population with various forms of assistance, using the government funds, and the government with information and reports.

The Uzbekistan Red Crescent provides regular on-site trainings and workshops in these *mahallyas*, which arrange meetings with communities. This integration promotes the work of the Uzbekistan Red Crescent.

However, a number of planned meetings was not organised and the Qarshi branch of the Uzbekistan Red Crescent did not prepare a schedule of meetings with partners, volunteers and beneficiaries.

Partners

- Istikbolli Avlod Foundation
- Women's Committee of the Republic of Uzbekistan
- Kamolot Social Youth Movement
- Mahalla Foundation
- Nuroni Foundation
- Ministry of Emergencies of the Republic of Uzbekistan

Conclusion

Despite the existing barriers, the project provides people with information and helps reduce the risks of discrimination, xenophobia, and social exclusion, as well as the risk of forced labour.

The Uzbekistan Red Crescent has provided information to many potential migrants about their rights and responsibilities, and about the political systems, social security, and labour markets in countries of destination.

The work of the government commission which monitors all funds transferred to Uzbekistan takes significant time, which is why the project activities are delayed for an unknown period.

Recommendations

Neighbouring countries' experience of fulfilling the Central Asian Red Crescent Labour Migration Network project should be used. The work with government authorities needs to be improved to remove barriers. Project interests should be protected. Closer cooperation with NGOs is needed. Russian teachers should be involved to remove labour migrants' linguistic barriers and volunteers should be recruited to make the project successful. Close cooperation with the media needs to be established to distribute information about the project among the general public.

General Conclusion

The activities of the Central Asian Red Crescent Labour Migration Network in the region deserve positive assessment. Thousands of potential labour migrants and their families receive information, psychological, legal, humanitarian, and medical assistance. The information and education centres were opened in all countries and almost all of them have training modules. The number of partners is increasing and in some countries the project is strongly supported by government authorities. In Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan the project goals and objectives have had a clear progress. The centres will be able to provide services to the population for many years.

The number of people who know about the Red Cross and Red Crescent is growing. However, not all of them know about the project and its objectives or have information about the project activities in the countries of destination.

Despite the limited timeframes, the project staff and volunteers have done a lot of work. The number of people who would like to receive assistance is growing. Young people who do not have a labour migration experience also express their interest in the project. The project is integrated with other Red Crescent programmes and has common target groups with them.

Despite the existing difficulties and barriers, the project staff does its best to achieve the project goals. The project coordination has been very good. This is proved by the fact that hundreds of potential labour migrants receive daily assistance at the information and education centres.

This project is an important regional and global initiative. Its multiple beneficiaries hope that the programme will continue because such social initiatives support vulnerable groups. The assistance provided by the project is also important because many labour migrants learned about their rights and found solutions to their problems with the help of this project only. Information about entry/exit requirements in the countries of destination or transit is also very important. Information about first aid, healthy lifestyle or dangerous diseases such as TB and HIV helps raise awareness and promote safe behaviour. Legal consultations on the laws of the country of departure or destination were also very useful. Psychological assistance is another significant benefit provided by the project because many people face problems and difficulties and their rehabilitation can be easier with the help of a psychologist. In many remote regions, Russian and computer courses meet the needs of beneficiaries.

So, the project goals and objectives have been fulfilled and the expected outcomes have been achieved.

General Recommendation and Assessment Criteria

Sharing of experience within the Red Crescent network should be improved. Beneficiaries should be informed about the project in the countries of departure and destination. The number of labour migrants going to Russia increases every year. For this reason, the Russian Red Cross should be involved to share experience and implement new mechanisms. Government authorities should be approached with cooperation proposals. The media should be involved to distribute information about the project among beneficiaries. Booklets and brochures about the project activities in all countries involved should be prepared.

Assessment Criteria:

Significance and Relevance

– ***To what extent does the project meet the priorities of beneficiaries?***

The majority of labour migrants who go or are going to work abroad do not know the language of the country of their destination and its labour market. This makes them exposed to human trafficking, exploitation, fraud, and violation. Unacceptable household

and employment conditions cause dissemination of diseases. Psychological problems are also a concern.

This project fully meets the basic needs of labour migrants and their families as it uses a comprehensive approach, from legal consultations and training in safe behaviour to psychological support. The legal assistance they receive in all the National Societies (migrants say this is the most important issue for them) is an important contribution to the improvement of their position and the lives of their families.

The significance of the Russian courses proposed by the Tajikistan Red Crescent should be emphasised. They help labour migrants better integrate in host communities.

An important project achievement is that labour migrants receive necessary information and legal assistance in the countries of destination/transit.

– ***To what extent is the project adapted to local needs and context and to the existing priorities for cooperation with other stakeholders?***

The issue of internal and external migration remains a significant one in many countries. In the majority of cases, it is practically impossible to trace the exact number of migrants, especially internal ones. It is also not always possible to control external migration because migrants often mislead frontier, customs and migration services as to the purpose and timeframes of their visits. For these reasons, migrants, in particular illegal labour migrants, do not have access to basic services (healthcare, education, social security) in the countries of origin and destination. Many of them lack legal knowledge.

Migration flows are growing in Central Asia and from Central Asia to Russia. In Uzbekistan and Kyrgyzstan, internal migration is also increasing. The governments do not provide funds to support migrants. The majority of projects implemented by international organisations and NGOs do not work with beneficiaries directly but are aimed at improving the capacity of government authorities and migration agencies.

The Red Crescent project is a unique one in that it has direct access and provides services directly to migrants. In doing so, the project partially fills the gap not covered by government budgets.

Performance

– ***How efficiently were the financial, human, and time resources used to fulfil the work and how did it influence the outcomes?***

The project resources have been distributed taking into account the country context, the capacity of the National Societies, and the needs of beneficiaries. For example, some countries needed a psychologist, others did not. The same case is with Russian and computer courses: there is a high need for them in Tajikistan while in other countries this was not a priority.

All the National Societies have strict financial procedures with regard to the project and spend money as they were designated. However, we need to mention the difficult situation with funding in Uzbekistan where the National Society did not have an opportunity to fully implement the planned initiatives. The government monitoring of funds became an obstacle to the project implementation in this country. For this reason, the country and general budgets were reviewed and some money initially designated for Uzbekistan were transferred to Kazakhstan and regional initiatives because the activities in these two areas were more proactive and expenditure was, on the whole, in line with the initial plans.

Efficiency

– To what extent did the project achieve the expected results?

The project has achieved all the expected results in almost all countries, except Uzbekistan. In Uzbekistan, the compulsory government monitoring of funds delayed the receipt and spending of the project funds and the National Society has not achieved the planned indicators, especially as regards the number of beneficiaries. The project has not been sufficiently covered by the media because there was not enough time to prepare the planned information campaigns for beneficiaries. The National Society has not printed brochures for the same reason, since all information materials in Uzbekistan are subject to government checks, which take a lot of time.

However, despite this, the National Society has proactively worked with partners. Two centres were opened and equipped. They began operation in September 2010, however it lasted until February 2011 only when the next tranche was sent for monitoring. To consult potential migrants, the National Society involved its volunteers who had earlier received training on the health programme. This is also an example of programme integration which should be strengthened.

Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan deserve special mention. All the expected results have been achieved there with the help of all stakeholders. In these countries, almost all necessary parties were involved: government authorities, partners, beneficiaries, volunteers, and the National Societies' project staff.

– What are the key lessons for future implementation and joint work?

As we have already said, sharing of experience between the National Societies' project network needs to be improved and the experience of other projects needs to be used. Joint on-site work/sessions should be organised. With the available resources, experience, and, most important, their access to migrants, the information centres should continue their work, propose their services and information materials, and become a resource centre for all stakeholders. These centres can become a base for joint work with government authorities and sharing of experience.

As a recommendation, we believe that integration with other Red Crescent programmes should be strengthened. It exists in all countries (involvement of trainers and volunteers and joint meetings), however, taking into account the capabilities of the programmes, it can be extended significantly (the inclusion of migrants and their families in the lists of beneficiaries for harm reduction (distribution of condoms), distribution of medicines from the National Societies' stocks, or additional training in first aid, where access exists to beneficiaries).

– To what extent were the services and resources timely and to what extent the services have been supported to achieve the planned objectives?

This project is a pilot initiative of the Red Cross and Red Crescent in the region. For this reason, not all factors could have been taken into account when project locations have been considered. So, the work was implemented in certain places only. However, for such projects to reach their full capacity, the project geography should be extended to cover more beneficiaries.

In addition, in the beginning of the project, significant time was spent to equip the centres and organise the project activities in the region. For this reason, not all results were achieved in the first year, especially as regards the development of the network activities. The main work was done and the main results were achieved in the project's second year.

- ***How efficient were various parts of the plan with regard to the overall coordination?***
Our monitoring showed that the project was very efficiently coordinated by the International Federation. The work of the four National Societies was also efficient. Each National Society has provided a plan for the project period. These plans were fully compliant with the regional plan, which is the responsibility of the International Federation.
- ***What are the prospects of the project and the services provided by the National Societies?***
The project has proved its significance, necessity and priority for labour migrants in all project countries. The flows of labour migrants from the countries of departure increase every year and illegal movements are growing. These movements involve high exposure to human trafficking, exploitation, and infectious diseases because of bad working and living conditions and no access to healthcare services. In addition, migrants often engage themselves in criminal activities in the country of destination or transit.

This project has provided solutions to many of these problems. Because of its efficiency, it has already received partial support from new donors, but needs additional support to be continued for a longer period.

Impact

- ***What are the adverse or positive changes produced by the project for beneficiaries and the National Societies (direct or indirect, expected or unexpected)?***
Migration projects are undertaken in all the four countries by various institutions: international organisations, foreign and local NGOs, and government authorities. However, in many regions, especially remote ones, the Red Crescent is the only organisation that works with beneficiaries directly. Other organisations either are interested in building the state’s capacity with regard to migration management or do not have sufficient capability to work with target groups in a comprehensive manner.

This proves the unique role of the Red Crescent and facilitates the National Societies’ cooperation with all stakeholders. At present, the key partners involved in migration management in all the project countries know about the activities of the Red Crescent and invite it to meetings to discuss important decisions on migration.

Sustainability

- ***Will the project activities continue when donor funding ends (organisational and financial sustainability)?***
This project is integrated with many programmes/projects of the National Societies, in particular the health programme, whose target audience include labour migrants. So, migrants can receive partial assistance and support within the framework of this integration. Potential and existing labour migrants receive consultations not only from the project staff but also from volunteers from migrants and other beneficiaries. The project uses the “peer-to-peer” approach which has proved itself as the most efficient one for the work with migrants who prefer personal communication when looking for information about work, searching for jobs, or registration.

In addition, donors express interest in migration projects. This is confirmed by new allocations to the labour migration project in Kazakhstan by the Japanese government. In Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan the project will be partially integrated with other programmes until the end of 2011.

However, we should search for funds because the flows of migrants and, consequently, their needs are growing and project activities and locations should be extended (initially, the project included only several regions and towns as pilot locations).

Annex I

Questions asked during assessment to various target groups

Project staff

1. How did you launch the project? When did project activities start?
2. What challenges did you face during the project implementation?
3. Where do you find labour migrants who become beneficiaries?
4. To how many migrants is assistance provided by the centre/on-site sessions every month? Please indicate the percentage of men and women.
5. What services do you provide to migrants?
6. How do you choose the most vulnerable migrants to distribute humanitarian assistance?
7. How many volunteers from migrants take part in the project? How do you motivate and retain them?
8. Did the project staff receive training in migration issues? When and where?
9. Do you train volunteers in distributing information? How many volunteer trainings were arranged?
10. Who are your partners and what are the areas of your cooperation?
11. Do you have training modules for volunteers and migrants? What are they?
12. Do you have a record of migrants who have received assistance?
13. What are the questions that migrants ask most often?
14. Do you have a schedule of activities? What changes did you made to plans?
15. Please provide the project budget.
16. Are information desks equipped? Where are they located and what materials do they have?
17. Do you use logos, signs or other visibility instruments?

Project volunteers

1. When and from whom did you know about the migration project? How long did you assist the project activities?
2. Did you receive training in the Red Crescent? In what areas and how many times?
3. Where are you from? When did you come here (Kazakhstan, Bishkek, etc.)? How long are you here for? Did you leave or do you plan to leave the country?
4. What questions do migrants ask most often?
5. What are, in your opinion, additional needs of migrants not covered by the project?
6. With how many migrants did you meet to tell about the Red Crescent (total, a month)?

Project partners (government authorities, NGOs, local authorities, international organisations, etc.)

1. When did you know about the Red Crescent's migration project?
2. What are the issues/areas of cooperation? How long do you cooperate?
3. Did you have any joint initiatives or activities?
4. What are your recommendations for the migration projects?
5. Do you have any plans and/or proposals for future cooperation?

6. Did you see the project logo in any places other than the centre, or information materials, leaflets or other sources of information?

Project beneficiaries/labour migrants and their families

1. How and when did you know that the Red Crescent provides assistance to migrants?
2. When and where from did you come? Is this your first visit (to Kazakhstan, a city)?
3. Did you go anywhere to work before? How many times and where? If you plan to go, where?
4. Where do you work? Did you meet the staff or volunteers of the Red Crescent?
5. What trainings, consultations and information materials did you receive with the help of the Red Crescent?
6. What additional assistance would you like to receive?
7. What problems do you face when you go to work in another country?
8. What problems do you face when you return home?
9. Do you know that your country has the Red Crescent Society? Did you contact it?
10. Do you have a family? Where are your relatives/family? Are you in touch with them?
11. Do you have language difficulties in the country where you work? Do you understand what the Red Crescent or other organisations' representatives say and what is written in information materials?
12. Did you ever tell about the Red Crescent to your fellow citizens or relatives in your own country and/or in the country where you work?